

Agenda item:

[No.]

Cabinet Procurement Committee

On 28 April 2009

Report Title. **Highways and Street Lighting 2009-2013: Award of Contract**

Report authorised by: **Niall Bolger, Director of Urban Environment**

Signed :



16<sup>th</sup> April 2009

Contact Officer : Joan Hancox, Head of Sustainable Transport

Tel: 020 8489 1777

Email joan.hancox@haringey.gov.uk

Wards(s) affected: ALL

Report for: Key Decision

**1. Purpose of the report (That is, the decision required)**

- 1.1. To award the Lot 1 (Highways) contract for 4 years starting 1<sup>st</sup> July 2009
- 1.2. To award the Lot 2 (Street Lighting) contract for 4 years starting 1<sup>st</sup> July 2009.
- 1.3. To note the differences between the current and future contracts and to note that the opportunity to extend on a yearly basis for up to a further 4 years (8 years in total) depends on the performance of the Contractor in specific measured targets and market testing.

**2. Introduction by Cabinet Member**

- 2.1. The new Contracts are significantly different from the existing ones, taking into account the lessons learnt from existing contracts and introducing a range of performance criteria. The contracts have also been designed to address the concerns of Members and residents on quality, performance, workmanship and delivery times.
- 2.2. The tendering and evaluation process has been extremely thorough and

this will result in robust contracts for highways and street lighting from July this year and for future years.

- 2.3. The emphasis in these contracts is on partnership working, and on ensuring that the Council's values and objectives are delivered. For this reason, the contracts include sustainability objectives, employment opportunities, better communication, branding and joint working to provide more effective and responsive services to our residents.

### **3. State link(s) with Council Plan Priorities and actions and /or other Strategies:**

The Highways and Street Lighting Contract is managed by the Sustainable Transport Service which is part of the Frontline Services Business Unit of Urban Environment Department.

In order to fulfil many of the Council Plan Priorities and those of the Frontline Services vision of ***Excellent Frontline Services that delight our diverse customers*** it is essential that these Contracts are awarded on time and in accordance with procurement legislation.

Specifically these contracts will assist in delivering the following key priorities:

#### **Making Haringey one of London's greenest boroughs**

- Improve the management of environmental resources
- Promote sustainable and safe travel and reduce congestion

#### **Delivering excellent, customer focused, cost effective services**

- Improve customer satisfaction, perception and service performance
- Commission and procure excellent and value for money services

#### **Creating a Better Haringey – cleaner, greener and safer**

- Improve road condition and street infrastructure
- Contribute to the reduction of crime and the fear of crime
- Contribute to Haringey's regeneration

#### **Encouraging lifetime well-being at home, work, play and learning**

- Contribute to the health of Haringey residents

### **4. Recommendations**

- 4.1. To an award-in-principle of the Lot 1 Contract to Contractor L (named in the excluded part of this report)
- 4.2. To an award-in-principle of the Lot 2 Contract to Contractor D (named in the excluded part of this report)
- 4.3. That Members agree to delegate power to confirm award of the contract to the recommended contractors upon successful completion of the leaseholder consultation period to the Cabinet Member for Environment

and Conservation and the Director of Urban Environment.

- 4.4. That the option for extending the contracts be reviewed, including market testing, after two years and the results of the review be reported to Cabinet Procurement prior to any extensions being awarded.

#### **5. Reason for recommendation(s)**

- 5.1. The full procurement process undertaken has been based on criteria that were decided prior to the tenders being sent out. The award of contract recommendations are based on evaluation against these criteria and as an outcome of a competitive tendering process.
- 5.2. The process has been undertaken properly and independently checked to ensure compliance with the agreed process.
- 5.3. The contract award cannot be made until statutory consultation has been completed with housing leaseholders.
- 5.4. Within each lot, there is the option to extend the four year contract by a further period of up to 4 years (making 8 years in total). Before a decision is made on extending the contracts, a review of contractor performance should be undertaken, and due to the yearly value of the contracts, a final decision on whether to extend the contracts or re-tender should be taken by Cabinet Procurement Committee.

#### **6. Other options considered**

- 6.1. The existing contracts have already been extended to allow for a full European tendering exercise, which was agreed by Cabinet Procurement Committee in November 2007. In the case of the street lighting contract it would not be possible to extend this any further as the contractor, EDF, are withdrawing from the street lighting market. On the highways contract, this has already been extended and it is not possible to extend this any further.
- 6.2. The procurement route for the highways and street lighting contracts was considered as part of the Public Realm Commissioning Strategy which was agreed by Cabinet in July 2008. The decision was that these elements of the public realm services should be tendered in a traditional manner.
- 6.3. The timescales between the award of this contract and the intended contract start date of 1 July 2009 are very tight. Due to the Councils' "call in" process and Alcatel, which is a 10 days standstill period, there will be only 6 weeks from award to start of Contract. As TUPE applies and some Contractors will need to find depots this is very tight, but manageable as long as there are no unexpected delays.

## **7. Summary**

- 7.1. The award of the highways and street lighting contracts is a culmination of 18 months work. This included the consideration of procurement options, the development of the tender documents and a thorough tendering and evaluation process. The annual value of the contract is in the region of £10 million, £8m for Lot 1 (highways) and £2m for Lot 2 (street lighting).
  
- 7.2. The Contract will provide for the delivery of both Planned and Responsive Highways and Streetlighting Works. The scope of the contract includes delivery on and off the public highway, although only work up to £0.5 Million on the Public Highway is offered on an exclusive basis. The scope of the Contract may be changed at any time by agreement between the Council and the Contractor. The exclusivity does not include work where an external funder may require another contractor to be not used, nor work where there are existing in-house or external suppliers carrying out works.

### **Preparation of the specification**

- 7.3. In order to ensure best practice a study of the procurement of similar contracts in various other London Authorities was carried out. After due consideration it was decided to use the ICE Term Contract as the legal basis and include as part of the evaluation site visits; depot visits and client interviews. The staff at London Borough of Lambeth, in particular, were helpful in providing the methodology they had used and this was refined to suit the needs of Haringey.
  
- 7.4. In order to achieve ongoing performance improvement during the life of the contract, it was agreed to adopt a system where extensions would be offered on the basis of meeting Key Performance Indicators (KPIs).
  
- 7.5. Other Council Departments and Homes for Haringey had an input into the contract. The scope of the work was widened considerably to include the option for the contract to be used by Homes for Haringey for works on housing land and also in parks and open spaces. All tenders which may lead to service charges to leaseholders have to go through a statutory consultation process. Two separate Section 20 notices (one for each Lot) were sent to all leaseholders in September 2008. A further two Section 20 notices will be sent out by 30<sup>th</sup> April 2009 and the award of contract will be subject to the consultation feedback.

### **Procurement process**

- 7.6. The restricted procedure of the European Procurement process has been carried out with the OJEU notice published on 28/7/08. A UK advert was also published.
  
- 7.7. The Pre Qualification Questionnaire (PQQ) was sent out and received back from 11 Contractors. The Council held a meet the buyer day on 19th August

2008 for contractors who had requested a PQQ. The Contractors were shortlisted from the PQQs and this led to:

7 contractors being sent tenders for Lot 1 – Highways and

7 contractors being sent tenders for Lot 2 – Street Lighting (with 5 common to both)

7.8. The contract documents once completed were independently checked by external quantity surveyors and then dispatched to all those shortlisted.

7.9. There were 5 Contractors who returned tenders for Lot 1 Highways and 7 Contractors who returned tenders for Lot 2 Street Lighting. There were 4 common to both.

### **Contract evaluation**

7.10. The tenders were returned in early January 2009 and were evaluated throughout January and February. The evaluation consisted of a financial and a quality evaluation.

7.11. The snow in February caused delays to the quality evaluation process, particularly site and depot visits. It was therefore agreed that full scores would be awarded for site and depot visits and client interviews to those contractors which were not going to be successful due to low scores from other parts of the evaluation. This is shown in Appendix A. This shows that had the visits been carried out, there would have been no prospect of the tenderers being successful even if they scored full marks available.

7.12. The rest of the quality evaluation was carried out and presentations held with all tenderers, as was the price evaluation.

7.13. A combined price quality matrix was compiled for each Lot. (See Appendix A in the confidential part of the agenda for further details)

### **8. Chief Financial Officer Comments**

8.1. The proposed award of contracts for Highways and Street Lighting will support the delivery of the authority's maintenance programmes from July 2009. The total revenue budget for highways and street lighting management held by Urban Environment for the whole of 2009/10 is approximately £2.1m. No savings are anticipated in the revenue element of the contracts.

8.2. In addition to the revenue budget, the contracts will also be used on schemes for other bodies, including Transport for London (TfL), and on capital. The funding the Council receives from TfL's Local Implementation Plan is subject to an annual bidding process and therefore can vary significantly year on year. The TfL allocation for 2009/10 is approximately £3.8m, and capital budgets of approximately £6m for highways and street lighting projects have also been agreed by the Council. The contracts may also be used for some works on behalf of Homes for Haringey.

- 8.3. Any part year saving generated in 2009/10 for the general fund will be offset at least in part by additional cost of IT software and hardware, and for training, to support the new contracts although details have yet to be finalised. This will be monitored through the monthly budget management arrangements.
- 8.4. The use of any full year indicative savings generated by new levels of process will be considered in the pre-business plan review process for 2010/13, having regard to the likely level of work to be placed.
- 8.5. The Council's budget setting process for 2008/09 to 2010/11 agreed resources of £500k, (£350k in 2008/09 and £150k in 2009/10), to meet specialist legal and technical costs associated with the procurement of Public Realm contracts (Highways, Street Lighting and Waste Management). These costs are estimated at £160k for the Highways and Street Lighting contracts (£129k in 2008/09 and £31k in 2009/10).

#### **9. Head of Legal Services Comments**

- 9.1. The value of each of the proposed contracts exceed £250,000 therefore the award requires the approval of the Procurement Committee in accordance with CSO 11.03
- 9.2. Legal Services have been closely involved in the procurement of these contracts.
- 9.3. The procurement process was carried out in full compliance with EU legislation and the Public Contract Regulations 2006 following the publication of an OJEU notice which was published on 28/07/08.
- 9.4. As the value of each contract exceeds £500,000 details of each contract has been included on the Council's Forward Plan.
- 9.5. The report states that the statutory leaseholder consultation process is due to commence on 30<sup>th</sup> April 2009 for a 30 day period and is due to expire on 30<sup>th</sup> May 2009.
- 9.6. A decision-in-principle by Cabinet Procurement Committee to award the contracts to which this report relates to the recommended contractors will not invalidate the statutory consultation process, provided that the Council does not execute any agreement or issues any works instructions and works do not commence before the statutory period has expired and proper consideration is given to any further leaseholder observations received before the deadline of 30<sup>th</sup> May 2009.
- 9.7. The report is further recommending that members delegate the power to confirm the award of the contract to the recommended contractors upon successful completion of the leaseholder consultation period to the Cabinet Member for Environment and Conservation and Director of Urban Environment.

- 9.8. The Head of Legal Services confirms that, subject to the proviso set out in paragraph 9.6 (above), there are no legal reasons preventing Members from approving the recommendations set out in paragraph 4 of the report

#### **10. Head of Procurement Comments**

- 10.1 Corporate Procurement have been involved in this procurement project from the outset, advising on the form of contract, the evaluation criteria and supporting the overall process.
- 10.2 In addition, Corporate Procurement arranged an independent review of the specifications before they were issued to bidders and a further review of the evaluation outcomes & recommendations.
- 10.3 The Councils' Sustainable Procurement Manager was involved in specifying the environmental criteria expected of contractors and was also involved in the evaluation process and site visits.
- 10.4 The Head of Procurement is therefore satisfied that the recommendations being put forward to Members are the result of a robust competitive process and which offer best value to the Council.

#### **11. Equalities & Community Cohesion Comments**

- 11.1 The equalities service has been consulted during the process and has no equality concerns
- 11.2 The Contract mentions the Haringey Guarantee but does not require it. This was mentioned by several of the tenderers and training was also a consideration in the quality evaluation.
- 11.3 The procurement process has involved the submission of equalities information with regard to policies and practices of all contractors. The contractors' equality information submissions have been assessed and reviewed. This process has allowed the council to assess the contractor's commitment to equalities and diversity against their own policies and practices and ensure that they are aware of and capable of adhering to the council's equality principles and requirements.
- 11.4 It is recommended that the successful contractor is supported to carry out an equalities impact assessment.

#### **12. Consultation**

- 12.1. In advance of the procurement process a Borough wide consultation was carried out in June 2007 with over 3500 responses showed several key issues that local residents prioritised. Overall the results showed that pothole repairs and pavement replacement are the main priorities for residents throughout the borough. Street Lighting was also high on their list

of priorities. These contracts will enable the Council to carry out these works as well as all the others seen to be priorities as budgets become available.

- 12.2. As part of the process stakeholder meetings with other departments within the Council and Homes for Haringey were carried out.
- 12.3. Section 20 notices were issued to Leaseholders as the first stage in the statutory consultation of leaseholders.
- 12.4. Interviews were carried out with several London Boroughs in deciding on the best form of Contract and options for inclusion as well as methods used for procurement and especially evaluation.
- 12.5. Part of the actual evaluation included interviews with current Clients of the Contractors.

### **13. Service Financial Comments**

- 13.1. The tenders were put out later than expected and due to the fall in prices recently in the sector the tenders have come back below the expected level. However the range of prices has been unusually wide with the difference between the lowest and highest cost being around double.
- 13.2. The level of financial stability in the market place has been checked throughout the process using the Dun and Bradstreet checks. A final check will be made on the winning tenderers prior to the actual award.
- 13.3. Although it is impossible to give an exact comparison of current costs to the new rates due to significant changes in the new contracts it is estimated that the winning Contractors for both lots are cheaper for capital works than the existing rates which have themselves been held at zero increase for the past year for the extensions.
- 13.4. Whilst there may be some savings on capital works in the first year (2009-2010), it is proposed to offset these to ensure appropriate software and hardware are in place as well as other increased costs of setting up the Contract. It is not envisaged that there will be savings in the revenue maintenance budgets for either highways or street lighting.
- 13.5. The purchasing power will be reduced from the second year onwards when the Baxter inflation effect is taken into consideration which is approximately 6% per annum as it tends to be higher than the rate of inflation as this will erode some of the windfall of the first year.



#### 14. Use of appendices /Tables and photographs

- 14.1. Appendix A gives the results of the evaluation process and is exempt information under the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 (see 15 below)

#### 15. Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985

- 15.1. This report contains exempt and non exempt information. The background papers relating to this project are:
- Invitation to tender documents – November 2008
- 15.2. Exempt information is contained in Appendix A and is **NOT FOR PUBLICATION**. The exempt information is under the following category (identified in the amended Schedule 12A of the Local Government Act 1972):
- Information relating to the financial or business affairs of any particular person (including the authority holding that information).

#### 16. Background

##### Works to be Included in the Contract

- 16.1 The Highway and Street Lighting Contract (in two lots) will be the only Term Contract to be let by the Council for provision of these services on the Public Highway. The Council, at its sole discretion, reserves the right to place works in these categories outside the Contract through individually tendered contracts for works packages in excess of **£500,000** in value.
- 16.2 For work off the Public Highway the Council may use this Term Contract but, at its sole discretion, reserves the right to place works in these categories outside the Contract through other Term Contracts or individually tendered contracts.
- 16.3 The provision of Pay and Display machines; CCTV cameras, Automated Public Conveniences and other items of a specialist nature not specifically referred to in the Schedule of Rates will normally not be procured through this contract even when on the public Highway.
- 16.4 There are also arrangements with both in-house DSO's and specialist Contractors for Cleansing; Refuse; Recycling and Grounds Maintenance and their works on the Public Highway are not offered under this contract on an exclusive basis, although from time to time some of the work they currently carry out might be requested of one or other of these lots.
- 16.5 For the sake of clarity, the Highway and Street Lighting Contractor(s) must accept **each** and **every** Works Order placed by the Council, to **any value**.

## LOT 1: HIGHWAYS

16.6 **Highways Planned Works:** The Council requires the capability to construct, at reasonable but varying periods of notice, and within reasonable time periods, civil engineering works, principally comprising, but not limited to, footway or carriageway construction or reconstruction works, traffic management works, road safety works, drainage, duct installation works, signage and environmental improvement works which may be on or off the highway.

16.7 **Highways Responsive Works:** The Council requires the capability to provide:-

- A comprehensive **Responsive Highways Repairs Services** to defects on its highways network, which generally contravene set safety intervention levels, within a defined but varying response time, according to the severity and location of the defects. The service will cover all non-electrical elements of the highway infrastructure, including footway and carriageway construction, street furniture, signs and lining, pedestrian guard railing, bollards, gullies and surface water drainage connections. (This service may be extended to cover repairs to defects within external parts of housing estates and/or schools and/or parks.)
- An **Emergency Call Out Service**, 24 hours a day, 365 days a year, to attend emergency incidents and repair and make safe the highway including temporary traffic management signage, diversions, etc. It is anticipated that the majority of emergency call outs will be to deal with highway defects, but the contractor will also be expected to deal with other emergency highway related work, such as removal of debris or obstructions.

## LOT 2 : STREETLIGHTING

16.8 **Street Lighting Planned Works:** The Council requires the capability to construct, at reasonable but varying periods of notice, and within reasonable time periods, electrical works, principally comprising, but not limited to street lighting, other external lighting and illuminated signage works which may be on or off the Public Highway.

16.9 **Street Lighting Responsive Works:** The Council requires the capability to provide:-

- A comprehensive **Responsive Street Lighting Repairs Services** to defects on its highways network, within a defined response time, according to the severity and location of the defects. The service will cover all electrical elements of the highway infrastructure, other than Traffic Signals. (This service may be extended to cover repairs to defects within external parts of housing estates and/or schools and/or parks.)

- An **Emergency Call Out Service**, 24 hours a day, 365 days a year, to attend emergency incidents and repair and make safe the highway including temporary traffic management signage, diversions, etc. It is anticipated that the majority of emergency call outs will be to deal with electrical defects, but the contractor will also be expected to deal with other emergency highway related work, such as removal of debris or obstructions.

16.10 Emergency Call-Out service is in both Lots 1 and 2 and if a single Contractor were to be appointed to both Lots this would be seen to be a direct saving and specific prices have been requested for the provision of both services under Lot 2 if appointed to both. Please note this is additional to the percentage savings offered for winning both Lots.

### **Performance Monitoring & Improvement**

16.11 The contracts are significantly different from the existing ones making performance criteria central with new Key Performance Indicators for the Contract based on:

- Quality of Work
- Safety;
- Consideration to the Public;
- Delivery within Time Requirements;
- Innovation and Sustainability.

These will be used in deciding whether to award work not exclusively included in this contract and in awarding any extensions beyond the first four years to a maximum of eight years. These same criteria have been used as part of the evaluation of the quality of the tenderers.

16.12 The Council's vision is for the Contract to develop into a 'total trust' partnership where the Contractor delivers first class services in all respects with minimal input and supervision from the Council. The extension on the Contract will be judged on the performance of the contractor. This will be based on progress towards the partnership and also on Key Performance Indicators (KPI's), which will be monitored and calculated by the Council on a regular basis. It is anticipated that the Contract will evolve during the Contract Period through the negotiation of variations to ensure the contractor continues to deliver Best Value services to the Council.

16.13 The Council anticipates that its own and the Contractor's staff involved in the operation of the Contract will engage in a constant dialogue to ensure that the works and services continue to be delivered to time, cost and quality. It is envisaged that there would be a regular series of meetings to ensure the smooth running of the Contract, to monitor performance, to discuss progress and programmes, to identify and find solutions to problems, and to further progress toward partnership working, etc. It is intended that this process will be commenced prior to the Contract start date, to enable staff from both organisations to agree communications and administrative arrangements, and to ensure a smooth start to the Contract.

### **Benefits of the new contracts**

- 16.14 The new Contracts also emphasise the need to develop enhanced sustainability requirements. This includes the requirement to develop a Sustainability Action Plan for the Contractors delivery of the service to ensure that it uses working methods, equipment and materials that will improve the sustainability of delivering the contract requirements, with particular emphasis on the following sustainability objectives in line with the Greenest Borough Strategy.
- a. increased recycled content
  - b. reduced transport distances
  - c. whole life cost considerations
  - d. reduced energy use and CO2 emissions
  - e. waste reduction
  - f. reducing impact on the community i.e. noise & disruption
- 16.15 The Contractor will work with the Council to identify innovative methods and materials and actively encourage their use in schemes that will lead to improved delivery of the sustainability objectives of the contract. The Contractor shall encourage their supply chain to help them meet the sustainability objectives of this contract. They will produce a materials sourcing plan for the items covered under the Schedule of Rates and will be required to use only transparently and sustainably sourced timber.
- 16.16 The Council recognises that often vehicles are used in more than one Borough on this type of Contract. However, where vehicles are dedicated to the Contract the Council Livery should be used to show joint working.
- 16.17 The contract introduces a new clause for the Council on tackling economic deprivation in the European Union. Therefore in appointing subcontractors, or suppliers to carry out the Works, the Contractor will be required to use reasonable endeavours to select at least 10% of them from businesses with registered offices in Deprived Areas. Furthermore the Contractor will use reasonable endeavours to ensure that at least 10% of the workforce it deploys at anyone time to carry out the Works live in a Deprived Area. For the purposes of this Agreement "workforce" will include the workforce of the Contractor and any of its subcontractors and sub-subcontractors deployed at anyone time in the carrying out of the Works. This is in line with the Council's regeneration objectives.
- 16.18 Other benefits of the new contract include:
- Requirement to register under the Considerate Constructor Scheme
  - Corporate Livery to enhance working in Partnership with Haringey
  - Prompt Payment of Sub-Contractors
  - Opportunity for the Contractor to have one staff member co-located in the Council offices for each Lot.
  - The Quality Plans submitted as part of the Tender process describe how the Contractor will ensure the delivery of services to the highest standards. These will form part of the Contract Documents and as such

the Contractor will be bound to comply with their terms in full.

- 16.19 Other benefits specific to the Contractor(s) appointed are given in Appendix A as these are specific to the Contractor(s) named in that confidential part of the report.

## 17 Valuation Process

- 17.1 The EU procurement process requires the evaluation criteria to be set out in advance of receipt of tenders. The quality evaluation criteria were set out in the Contract documents and are summarised below:

- The Quality Submission - the tenderer was required to clearly present their proposals for how this particular service will be delivered
- The Quality Panel awarded marks against the Quality Assessment Headings listed in the document using the scoring systems as set out in Table 1 below:

**Table 1 Quality Scoring**

Standards	Marks
Very high standards; Proposal likely to exceed all delivery targets	10
Good Standard: Proposals likely to meet all delivery standards and exceed some delivery targets	8-9
Acceptable standard: Workable proposals likely to achieve most delivery targets	5-7
Poor standard: significant reservations but not sufficient to warrant exclusion of tender	1-4
Not acceptable: Tender excluded	0

- A weighting was given to the different parts of the Quality Assessment as shown in Table 2 below:

**Table 2 Quality Weighting**

Statement	Percentage of Total Quality Score
<b>A. Service Provision and Workforce Matters</b>	<b>10%</b>
<b>B. Materials and Workmanship</b>	<b>12%</b>
<b>C. Control of Sub-Contractors</b>	<b>8%</b>
<b>D. Delivery within Time Requirements of Contract</b>	<b>12%</b>
<b>E. Health and Safety</b>	<b>3%</b>
<b>F. Dealing with Those Affected by Contractor Activity</b>	<b>7%</b>
<b>G. Quality Policy and Practices</b>	<b>8%</b>
<b>Site Performance</b>	<b>25%</b>
<b>Client Perspective</b>	<b>15%</b>

- The highest marked tender was given 100 marks with the others scored pro rata. The quality threshold below which tenders were not considered further is 60 marks, or a zero against any one of the Quality Assessment Headings.

17.2. Determination of the lowest financial tender was based on a model of the anticipated quantities for items in the Schedule of Rates, based on past invoices and estimated future budgets and agreed before the tenders were opened. The lowest acceptable financial tender submitted was awarded 100 marks. Other acceptable tenders had one mark deducted for each percentage point by which the total exceeds that of the lowest, thus a total of 12% above the lowest would receive 88 marks.

17.3. The marks for the Quality Submission and the Financial Submission were weighted in the ratio of 60:40 respectively. The quality percentage was multiplied by 0.6, the price percentage by 0.4. The sum of these evaluations was given a final score. An example is given in Table 3.

**Table 3 Scoring Example (not based on actual tenders)**

Tender	Price	Price %	P% x 0.4	Quality %	Q% x 0.6	d+f	g * 100
<i>a</i>	<i>b</i>	<i>c</i>	<i>d</i>	<i>e</i>	<i>f</i>	<i>G</i>	<i>h</i>
A	£1,234,500	89.30%	<b>0.3572</b>	85.00%	<b>0.51</b>	0.8672	86.72
B	£1,115,180	100.00%	<b>0.4</b>	70.00%	<b>0.42</b>	0.82	82
C	£1,400,000	74.50%	<b>0.298</b>	100.00%	<b>0.6</b>	0.898	89.8
D	£1,250,000	87.90%	<b>0.3516</b>	95.00%	<b>0.57</b>	0.9216	92.16

**Tender D is accepted**

17.4. Appendix A gives the results of the evaluation process and is exempt information under the Local Government (Access to Information) Act 1985 (see 15 above)